

## 2001 Current Fiscal Year Report: National Bioethics Advisory Commission

Report Run Date: 07/25/2025 03:13:51 AM

<b>1. Department or Agency</b>	<b>2. Fiscal Year</b>
Department of Health and Human Services	2001
<b>3. Committee or Subcommittee</b>	<b>3b. GSA Committee No.</b>
National Bioethics Advisory Commission	1958

<b>4. Is this New During Fiscal Year?</b>	<b>5. Current Charter</b>	<b>6. Expected Renewal Date</b>	<b>7. Expected Term Date</b>
No	07/26/1996		10/03/2001

<b>8a. Was Terminated During Fiscal Year?</b>	<b>8b. Specific Termination Authority</b>	<b>8c. Actual Term Date</b>
Yes		10/03/2001

<b>9. Agency Recommendation for Next Fiscal Year</b>	<b>10a. Legislation Req to Terminate?</b>	<b>10b. Legislation Pending?</b>
Terminate	Yes	Pending

**11. Establishment Authority** Presidential

<b>12. Specific Establishment Authority</b>	<b>13. Effective Date</b>	<b>14. Committee Type</b>	<b>14c. Presidential?</b>
E.O. 12975	10/03/1995	Continuing	Yes

**15. Description of Committee** National Policy Issue Advisory Board

**16a. Total Number of Reports** No Reports for this Fiscal Year

**17a. Open** 4 **17b. Closed** 0 **17c. Partially Closed** 0 **Other Activities** 0 **17d. Total** 4

### Meetings and Dates

<b>Purpose</b>	<b>Start</b>	<b>End</b>
To discuss the draft report on ethical and policy issues in the oversight of human subjects research	10/24/2000	10/25/2000

To discuss the draft chapters of the oversight  
of human research report and the draft 12/07/2000 - 12/08/2000  
report on international research

To discuss clinical trials in developing  
countries for draft report in international 01/18/2001 - 01/19/2001  
research.

To discuss the various chapters of the draft  
report on the oversight of research involving 03/15/2001 - 03/16/2001  
human participants

**Number of Committee Meetings Listed: 4**

	<b>Current FY</b>	<b>Next FY</b>
<b>18a(1). Personnel Pmts to Non-Federal Members</b>	\$75,600.00	\$0.00
<b>18a(2). Personnel Pmts to Federal Members</b>	\$0.00	\$75,600.00
<b>18a(3). Personnel Pmts to Federal Staff</b>	\$976,766.00	\$976,766.00
<b>18a(4). Personnel Pmts to Non-Member Consultants</b>	\$1,248,270.00	\$1,248,270.00
<b>18b(1). Travel and Per Diem to Non-Federal Members</b>	\$0.00	\$0.00
<b>18b(2). Travel and Per Diem to Federal Members</b>	\$0.00	\$0.00
<b>18b(3). Travel and Per Diem to Federal Staff</b>	\$200,000.00	\$200,000.00
<b>18b(4). Travel and Per Diem to Non-member Consultants</b>	\$0.00	\$0.00
<b>18c. Administrative Costs (FRNs, contractor support, In-person/hybrid/virtual meetings)</b>	\$0.00	\$0.00
<b>18d. Other (all other funds not captured by any other cost category)</b>	\$625,000.00	\$625,000.00

<b>18e. Total Costs</b>	\$3,125,636.00	\$3,125,636.00
<b>19. Federal Staff</b>	13.00	13.00
<b>Support Years (FTE)</b>		

**20a. How does the Committee accomplish its purpose?**

The National Bioethics Advisory Commission advises, consults with, and makes recommendations to the National Science and Technology Council and its Chair, the President, Federal agencies, and other appropriate entities, including the scientific community, professional associations, academic institutions, Congress, and the public on the appropriateness of departmental, agency, or other governmental programs, policies, assignments, missions, guidelines, and regulations in their relationship to bioethical issues arising from biomedical, clinical and social research. It accomplishes these tasks through the following mechanisms: deliberations at Commission meetings, contracting/ commissioned papers from public, professional, and scientific experts in relevant fields, and through testimony by recognized experts and the public. In addition, opportunities are afforded the public at each meeting to provide comments. In FY 1999, the Commission completed three reports, one of which was in direct response to President Clinton's request. NBAC submitted to the President, through the National Science and Technology Council (NSTC), its report, Research Involving Persons with Mental Disorders That May Affect Decisionmaking Capacity (2 vol.). The report contained 21 recommendations designed to enhance protections for human subjects who had mental disorders. The report was referred to the Committee on Science of the NSTC and to Federal agencies for comment. NBAC selected this topic because it was timely, raised critically

important questions for the research community, and for patients and families. In July 1999, NBAC submitted its report, Research Involving Human Biological Materials: Ethical Issues and Policy Guidance (Executive Summary and Vol. 1; a second volume for this report containing commissioned papers will be published in FY 2000). NBAC selected this topic because advances in genetic research raised important concerns about the use of genetic (and non-genetic) information, there were disagreements amongst the scientific community about key issues, and because of perceived ambiguity in the Federal regulations. On November 14, 1998, the President asked the Commission to consider the ethical, medical, and legal implications of embryonic stem cell research, including the mingling of human and non-human species. NBAC submitted its report, Ethical Issues in Human Stem Cell Research, to the NSTC on September 7, 1999 (Executive Summary and Vol. 1; a second volume for this report containing commissioned papers, and a third volume containing the written testimony from eleven religious scholars will both be published in FY 2000).

**20b. How does the Committee balance its membership?**

The President appointed 18 individuals, including the Commission chair, from a pool of knowledgeable non-government experts and community representatives with special qualifications and competence to provide effective recommendations on a wide range of bioethical issues. At least three members must represent the public and at least one member must be from the following areas of expertise: Philosophy/theology; social/behavioral science; law; medicine/allied

health professions; and biological research.

**20c. How frequent and relevant are the Committee Meetings?**

The original charter stated that meetings may be called up to 10 times a year; the two renewal charters state that there may be up to 12 meetings a year. In order to respond to the very tight deadline for the specific reports requested by the President, the Commission has sometimes met more frequently than expected. The agenda of the meetings are focused on the various aspects of the specific issues being deliberated.

**20d. Why can't the advice or information this committee provides be obtained elsewhere?**

The President established the Commission after a twelve-year absence of any such body. The Commission is to identify broad, overarching principles to govern the ethical conduct of research. There are a considerable number of bioethical issues that impact not only on the ethical conduct of research, but the health and well being of the Nation.

**20e. Why is it necessary to close and/or partially closed committee meetings?**

N/A

**21. Remarks**

President Bush has terminated and has implemented a new committee. Waiting for final report

**Designated Federal Officer**

Eric M. Meslin Executive Director, National Bioethics Advisory Commission

Committee Members	Start	End	Occupation	Member Designation
-------------------	-------	-----	------------	--------------------

			Research Associate Professor of Bioethics, Portland State University, and Assistant Director, Center for Ethics in Health Care, Oregon Health Sciences University, Portland, Oregon	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Backlar, Patricia	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		
			Assistant Professor of Clinical Pediatrics, University of Miami School of Medicine, Miami, Florida	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Brito, Arturo	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		
			Henry W. Bruce Professor of Law and Co-Director, Pacific Center for Health Policy and Ethics, University of Southern California Law Center, Los Angeles, California	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Capron, Alexander	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		
			Clinical Professor of Public Health, Cornell University Medical College, New York, New York	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Cassell, Eric	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		
			Professor of Law and Medical Ethics, Schools of Law and Medicine, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Charo, R.	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		
			Kyle Professor of Religious Studies, Professor of Medical Education, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, Virginia	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Childress, James	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		
			Scientific Director, Perlegen Sciences, Santa Clara, California	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Cox, David	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		

			Vice Provost Emerita, Dean Emerita, and Lucille	Special Government
Dumas, Rhetaugh	09/16/1996	10/03/2001	Cole Professor of Nursing, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan Senior Research and Policy Associate, Dept. of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry, Columbia University College of Physicians & Surgeons, New York, New York	Employee (SGE) Member
Flynn, Laurie	07/19/1996	10/03/2001	Professor of Molecular Biology and Genetics, The Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, Maryland	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Greider, Carol	10/29/1996	10/03/2001	Chief Business Officer, Millennium Pharmaceuticals Inc., Cambridge, Massachusetts	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Holtzman, Steven	07/19/1996	10/03/2001	Founding President, Richmond Bioethics Consortium, Richmond, Virginia	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Kramer, Bette	09/16/1996	10/03/2001	Director, Program In Medical Ethics, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, California	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Lo, Bernard	07/19/1996	10/03/2001		Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Miike, Lawrence	07/19/1996	10/03/2001	Kaneohe, Hawaii	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Murray, Thomas	07/19/1996	10/03/2001	President, The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Oldaker, William	09/21/1999	10/03/2001	Oldaker & Harris, LLP, Washington, D.C.	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member

Scott-Jones, Diane	07/19/1996	10/03/2001	Professor, Department of Psychology, Temple University, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member
Shapiro, Harold	07/19/1996	10/03/2001	President, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey	Special Government Employee (SGE) Member

**Number of Committee Members Listed: 18**

## Narrative Description

**What are the most significant program outcomes associated with this committee?**

Checked if  
Applies

Improvements to health or safety	<input type="checkbox"/>
Trust in government	<input type="checkbox"/>
Major policy changes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Advance in scientific research	<input type="checkbox"/>
Effective grant making	<input type="checkbox"/>
Improved service delivery	<input type="checkbox"/>
Increased customer satisfaction	<input type="checkbox"/>
Implementation of laws or regulatory requirements	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other	<input type="checkbox"/>

## Outcome Comments

**What are the cost savings associated with this committee?**

Checked if Applies

None	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Unable to Determine	<input type="checkbox"/>
Under \$100,000	<input type="checkbox"/>
\$100,000 - \$500,000	<input type="checkbox"/>



\$500,001 - \$1,000,000	<input type="checkbox"/>
\$1,000,001 - \$5,000,000	<input type="checkbox"/>
\$5,000,001 - \$10,000,000	<input type="checkbox"/>
Over \$10,000,000	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cost Savings Other	<input type="checkbox"/>

### **Cost Savings Comments**

**What is the approximate Number of recommendations produced by this committee for the life of the committee?**

0

### **Number of Recommendations Comments**

**What is the approximate Percentage of these recommendations that have been or will be Fully implemented by the agency?**

%

### **% of Recommendations Fully Implemented Comments**

**What is the approximate Percentage of these recommendations that have been or will be Partially implemented by the agency?**

%

### **% of Recommendations Partially Implemented Comments**

**Does the agency provide the committee with feedback regarding actions taken to implement recommendations or advice offered?**

Yes ☐ No ☐ Not Applicable ☒

### **Agency Feedback Comments**

**What other actions has the agency taken as a result of the committee's advice or recommendation?**

Checked if Applies

- |                                   |                          |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Reorganized Priorities            | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Reallocated resources             | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Issued new regulation             | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Proposed legislation              | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Approved grants or other payments | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Other                             | <input type="checkbox"/> |

**Action Comments**

**Is the Committee engaged in the review of applications for grants?**

No

**Grant Review Comments**

**How is access provided to the information for the Committee's documentation?**

Checked if Applies

- |                           |                          |
|---------------------------|--------------------------|
| Contact DFO               | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Online Agency Web Site    | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Online Committee Web Site | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Online GSA FACA Web Site  | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Publications              | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Other                     | <input type="checkbox"/> |

**Access Comments**